

LOCAL GOVERNMENT BOUNDARY COMMISSION FOR WALES

**REVIEW OF THE BOUNDARIES BETWEEN
THE COMMUNITIES OF LLANDAFF NORTH
AND WHITCHURCH, LLANISHEN AND
LISVANE, AND ELY AND ST FAGANS IN THE
CITY AND COUNTY OF CARDIFF**

REPORT AND PROPOSALS

LOCAL GOVERNMENT BOUNDARY COMMISSION FOR WALES

**REVIEW OF THE BOUNDARIES BETWEEN THE COMMUNITIES OF
LLANDAFF NORTH AND WHITCHURCH, LLANISHEN AND
LISVANE, AND ELY AND ST FAGANS IN THE CITY AND COUNTY
OF CARDIFF**

REPORT AND PROPOSALS

1. INTRODUCTION
2. THE COUNCIL'S PROPOSALS
3. THE COMMISSION'S CONSIDERATION
4. PROCEDURE
5. LLANDAFF NORTH / WHITCHURCH BOUNDARY
6. LLANISHEN / LISVANE BOUNDARY
7. ELY / ST FAGANS BOUNDARY
8. CONSIDERATION OF BOUNDARIES
9. ASSESSMENT
10. PROPOSALS
11. CONSEQUENTIAL ARRANGEMENTS
12. RESPONSES TO THIS REPORT

*The Local Government Boundary Commission For Wales
Caradog House
1-6 St Andrews Place
CARDIFF
CF10 3BE
Tel Number: (029) 20395031
Fax Number: (029) 20395250
E-mail: lgbc@lgbc-wales.gov.uk
www.lgbc-wales.gov.uk*

Edwina Hart AM MBE
Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities
The National Assembly for Wales

REVIEW OF THE BOUNDARIES BETWEEN THE COMMUNITIES OF LLANDAFF NORTH AND WHITCHURCH, LLANISHEN AND LISVANE, AND ELY AND ST FAGANS IN THE CITY AND COUNTY OF CARDIFF

REPORT AND PROPOSALS

1. INTRODUCTION

- 1.1 The County Council of the City and County of Cardiff (the Council) have conducted a review of the boundaries between the Communities of Llandaff North and Whitchurch, Llanishen and Lisvane, and Ely and St Fagans under Section 55(2) of the Local Government Act 1972 as amended by the Local Government (Wales) Act 1994 (the Act).
- 1.2 We have considered the Council's report in accordance with Section 55(3) of the Act and submit the following report on the Council's recommendations.

2. THE COUNCIL'S PROPOSALS

- 2.1 The Council have conducted a review of a number of the Community Councils in their area. As part of this review the Council have proposed changes to: the boundary between the Communities of Llandaff North and Whitchurch, Llanishen and Lisvane, and Ely and St Fagans.
- 2.2 The Council's proposals were submitted to the Commission on 20 June 2002.

3. THE COMMISSION'S CONSIDERATION

- 3.1 We first considered whether the Council had conducted their review in accordance with the procedure set out in the Act. We then considered whether the proposals recommended were apt for securing effective and convenient local government.

4. PROCEDURE

- 4.1 We are satisfied that the Council have conducted the review in accordance with the procedure set out in Section 60 of the Act.
- 4.2 On 11 July 2001, the Council published notice of the review in the local newspaper and on their web site. Letters were sent to individual households and to other

interested persons and organisations. The Council invited those with an interest to submit their representations within six weeks of the notification of the review. The initial notification detailed the Council's preliminary proposals for Llandaff North / Whitchurch, Llanishen / Lisvane, and Ely St Fagans. Plans of the areas under review were made available at the Council's offices and on their web site.

- 4.3 The Council considered the representations they received in response to their preliminary proposals and on 21 January 2002 published their Draft Proposals. Notices were again published in the local newspapers and on the Council's web site and householders and other interested parties and organisations were also contacted. Plans of the areas, illustrating the proposals, were made available at the Council's offices and on their web site. The Council allowed a further six-week period for the submission of representations.
- 4.4 The Council considered all responses to the Draft Proposals when preparing their Final Proposals.
- 4.5 In considering this boundary review, the Council took into consideration Section 54(1) of the Local Government Act 1972, which provides that the guiding principle of reviews shall be "for effecting changes ... desirable in the interests of effective and convenient local government".
- 4.6 The Council's Cabinet considered their Final Proposals at their meeting on 29 April 2002 and the proposals were accepted by the Council at their meeting on 16 May 2002.

5. LLANDAFF NORTH / WHITCHURCH BOUNDARY

- 5.1 Part of the existing boundary between Llandaff North and Whitchurch follows the old railway line which was removed several years ago and later developed for housing. The roads Coed Arian and Silverbirch Close have direct road access from the Community of Whitchurch and the area appears to have closer links with this Community than the Community of Llandaff North.
- 5.2 To give clear definition to the boundary between the Communities of Llandaff North and Whitchurch, the Council proposed that the boundary be redrawn to follow the line on the map at Appendix 1.
- 5.3 The effects of this proposal would be to move the properties on Coed Arian and Silverbirch Close from the Community of Llandaff North to the Community of Whitchurch. This will affect 312 electors (1 August 2002 electoral statistics supplied by Cardiff County Council).
- 5.4 No objections to this proposal were received by the Council during the course of the review.

6. LLANISHEN / LISVANE BOUNDARY

- 6.1 Part of the existing boundary between the Communities of Lisvane and Llanishen follows the line of an ancient hedge that was removed when Mill Race Close was built. This means that the development is split between the two Communities. The road access to Mill Race Close is from the Community of Lisvane.
- 6.2 To give clear definition to the boundary between the Communities of Lisvane and Llanishen, the Council proposed that the boundary be redrawn to follow the line on the map at Appendix 2.
- 6.3 The effects of this proposal would be to move properties on Clos Melin Dwr, Falfield Close, Mill Heath Drive, part of Mill Race Close and part of Mill Road from the Community of Llanishen to the Community of Lisvane. This will affect 157 electors (1 August 2002 electoral statistics supplied by Cardiff County Council).
- 6.4 No objections to this proposal were received by the Council during the course of the review.

7. ELY / ST FAGANS BOUNDARY

- 7.1 There are two parts of the existing boundary between the Communities of Ely and St Fagans under consideration. In the first area (shown on the map at Appendix 3), the boundary follows the line of an ancient hedge that was removed prior to residential development taking place. The Council reported that residents in the area have made vociferous objections to the current boundary line.
- 7.2 The Council have proposed that the boundary be redrawn to follow the line on the map at Appendix 3.
- 7.3 The effect of this proposal would be to move properties on Denison Way, Nant yr Drope, part of Clos y Cwarra and part of Falconwood Drive from the Community of Ely to the Community of St Fagans. This will affect 204 electors (1 August 2002 electoral statistics supplied by Cardiff County Council).
- 7.4 No objections to this proposal were received during the course of the review.
- 7.5 In the second area of the Ely / St Fagans boundary (shown on the map at Appendix 4), the existing boundary follows the pre-1974 Cardiff County Borough Council boundary. Subsequent developments have taken place across the boundary with the only access available via Stirling Road, Ely.
- 7.6 The Council have proposed that the boundary be redrawn to include the six bungalows on Lon Werdd Close within the Community of Ely.
- 7.7 The effect of this proposal would be to move six properties on Lon Werdd Close from the Community of St Fagans to the Community of Ely. This will affect 15 electors (1 August 2002 electoral statistics supplied by Cardiff County Council).

- 7.8 Objections to this proposal were received by the Council from a representative of the residents, the local Member of Parliament, the local Assembly Member and a local Councillor.
- 7.9 Following the submission of the Council's proposals to the Commission, two representations have been received from residents of Lon Werdd Close objecting to the proposal. Both representations consider that the proposed change would have a detrimental effect on the value of their homes and that the small number of electors involved would make little impact on the balance of electoral numbers. One of the residents drew attention to the fact that the proposed boundary on the plan published by the Council confusingly included some houses from Cwrt y Cadno.

8. CONSIDERATION OF BOUNDARIES

- 8.1 We agreed that as part of our consideration of the Council's recommendations it would be necessary to make a site visit to the area to inspect the proposed boundaries.
- 8.2 Accordingly, officers of the Commission made a visit to the area in August 2002. As a result of this visit we found that all but one of the proposed boundaries followed features that could be clearly identified. The exception was the proposed boundary to take Lon Werdd Close into Ely which, as pointed out in the representation we received, appeared to cut across properties in Cwrt y Cadno. The officers of the Commission did however identify an alternative line for the proposed boundary and this has been shown on the map at Appendix 4.

9. ASSESSMENT

- 9.1 We have noted that, with the exception of the second proposal for the Ely / St Fagans boundary, there is general support for the Council's proposals.
- 9.2 We have noted the objections to the proposal to transfer Lon Werdd Close from the Community of St Fagans to the Community of Ely. We accept that the new boundary proposed by the County Council was itself unsatisfactory for the reason given in paragraph 7.9 above, and the Commission has modified this proposal so as to remove that objection. The existing Community boundary follows the line of an obsolete boundary for which there is no geographical or electoral justification having regard to the housing and road developments which have taken place since 1974. The only access to the Close lies via Stirling Road which is in Ely, and there is no direct access either by road or footpath to the Close from St Fagans. This means that all Council services have access to the Close from the Community of Ely rather than from St Fagans. We are satisfied therefore that in terms of the provision of local government services it would be more effective and convenient to include Lon Werdd Close within the Ely Community rather than St Fagans' Community.

10. PROPOSALS

- 10.1 We have considered the proposals from the County Council of the City and County of Cardiff and have decided that they are apt for securing effective and convenient local government in the area. Accordingly, we make the proposals to the National Assembly for Wales. Maps showing the areas under review can be found at Appendices 1, 2, 3 and 4.

11. CONSEQUENTIAL ARRANGEMENTS

- 11.1 Under Section 54(1) (e) of the Act, the Commission may make proposals for change of electoral arrangements for any local government area, which is consequential on any proposed change in local government areas. We considered the effects of the proposals on the electoral arrangements of the communities involved and then considered the effects on the electoral divisions of the county council.

Community Electoral Arrangements

- 11.2 The Communities of Llandaff North and Whitchurch do not have Community Councils. The proposal to move part of the Community of Llandaff North to the Community of Whitchurch will therefore not require any consequential changes to the community electoral arrangements.
- 11.3 The Community of Llanishen does not have a Community Council but the Community of Lisvane has 10 councillors representing 2,676 electors. The proposal to transfer an area of the Community of Llanishen to Lisvane would effect an increase of 157 electors. These additional electors will increase the councillor/electorate ratio by 6% which we consider an insufficient increase to warrant any change to the electoral arrangements for the Community of Lisvane.
- 11.4 The Community of Ely does not have a Community Council but the Community of St Fagans has 8 councillors representing 1,372 electors. The proposals to transfer an area of the Community of Ely to St Fagans and the proposal to transfer an area of the Community of St Fagans to the Community of Ely would effect a net increase of 189 electors in the Community of St Fagans. These additional electors will increase the councillor/electorate ratio by approximately 14% which we consider sufficient to warrant the addition of 1 councillor to St Fagans Community Council.

County Electoral Arrangements

- 11.5 The Community of Llandaff North forms the Llandaff North electoral division of the County Council with 5,950 electors represented by 2 county councillors. The Community of Whitchurch forms part of the Whitchurch and Tongwynlais electoral division of the County Council with 12,003 electors represented by 4 county councillors. The proposed transfer of 312 electors from the Community of Llandaff North to the Community of Whitchurch would decrease the councillor/electorate ratio of the Llandaff North electoral division by 5% to 1:2,819 and increase the councillor/electorate ratio of the Whitchurch and Tongwynlais electoral division by

approximately 3% to 1:3,079. We consider these changes insufficient to warrant any changes to the electoral arrangements.

- 11.6 The Community of Llanishen forms the Llanishen electoral division of the County Council with 11,954 electors represented by 4 county councillors. The Community of Lisvane forms the Lisvane electoral division of the County Council with 2,676 electors represented by 1 county councillor. The proposed transfer of 157 electors from the Community of Llanishen to the Community of Lisvane would decrease the councillor/electorate ratio of the Llanishen electoral division by approximately 1.3% to 1:2,949 and would increase the councillor/electorate ratio of the Lisvane electoral division by approximately 6% to 1:2,833. We consider these changes insufficient to warrant any changes to the electoral arrangements.
- 11.7 The Community of Ely forms the Ely electoral division of the County Council with 10,227 electors represented by 3 county councillors. The Community of St Fagans with the Creigiau ward of the Community of Pentyrch forms the Creigiau / St Fagans electoral division of the County Council with 3,527 electors represented by 1 county councillor. The proposed net transfer of 189 electors from the Community of Ely to the Community of St Fagans would decrease the councillor/electorate ratio of the Ely electoral division by approximately 1.8% to 1:3,346 and would increase the councillor/electorate ratio of the Creigiau / St Fagans electoral division by approximately 5.4% to 1:3,716. We consider these changes insufficient to warrant any changes to the electoral arrangements.

12. RESPONSES TO THIS REPORT

- 12.1 Having completed our consideration of the review of the boundaries between the Communities of Llandaff North and Whitchurch, Llanishen and Lisvane, and Ely and St Fagans in the City and County of Cardiff and submitted our recommendations to the National Assembly for Wales, we have fulfilled our statutory obligation under the Act.
- 12.2 It now falls to the National Assembly for Wales, if it thinks fit, to accept them or to direct the Commission to conduct a further review.
- 12.3 Any further representations concerning the matters in the report should be addressed to the National Assembly for Wales. They should be made as soon as possible, and in any event not later than six weeks from the date that the Commission's recommendations are submitted to the National Assembly for Wales. Representations should be addressed to:

Local Government Modernisation 2 Division
National Assembly for Wales
Cathays Park
Cardiff
CF10 3NQ

MRS S G SMITH LLB (Chair)

J E DAVIES ICSA IPFA (Deputy Chair)

D H ROBERTS BSc DMS MBCS MCMi (Member)

E H LEWIS BSc. DPM FRSA FCIPD (Secretary)

November 2002